1 2

ORDER Page - 1 -

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

IN RE: PHENYLPROPANOLAMINE (PPA) PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION,

MDL NO. 1407

SUGGESTION OF REMAND ORDER

This document relates to the actions listed on Attachment A

The Court, having reviewed the records of the cases listed on Attachment A, and having heard argument of counsel, finds and rules as follows:

- (1) Common discovery and other coordinated pretrial proceedings have been completed. All remaining issues are case-specific, and best determined by the transferor courts.
- (2) These cases will not benefit from further coordinated proceedings as part of MDL 1407, and are ready to be remanded to their respective transferor courts.

For these reasons, pursuant to Rule 7.6 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, the Court issues its Suggestion of Remand Order in the cases listed on Attachment A. The Clerk is ORDERED to provide copies of this Order to the Clerk of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation and to the clerks of the transferor district courts listed

```
1
   on Appendix A.
2
         DATED at Seattle, Washington this 12th day of March, 2004.
 3
4
                                     s/ Barbara Jacobs Rothstein
                                     BARBARA JACOBS ROTHSTEIN
5
                                     UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
   ORDER
   Page - 2 -
```

APPENDIX A

2	
3	

1

3	WD WA Cause #	Case	Transferor Court/ Cause #
5	02-cv-538	Rhonda Bailey v. Schering- Plough Healthcare Prod- ucts, Inc.	Western Dist. of Kentucky, No. 01-213
6 7	02-cv-29	Eleanor D. Beattie, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Middle Dist. of Louisiana (Baton Rouge), No. 01-1025
8	01-cv-2026	Londell Bell v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-2018
10 11	01-cv-2137	Sharon Carter v. Bayer Corp.	Eastern Dist. of Kentucky(Covington), No. 01-199
12	02-cv-373	Lynette Fisk, et al. v. Novartis AG, et al.	Dist. of Utah (Central), No. 01-985
13 14	02-cv-1863	Daniel S. Goettsch v. Smithkline Beecham Con- sumer Healthcare, et al.	Dist. of Minnesota, No. 02-1268
15 16	01-cv-2227	Nina Hastings, et al. v. Novartis Corp.	Eastern Dist. of Texas (Sherman), No. 01-338
17 18	02-cv-1272	Gerald Jones, et al. v. Perrigo Co., et al.	Western Dist. of Kentucky (Bowling Green), No. 01-182
19	01-cv-1406	Stacey Kerrigan, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins, et al.	Dist. of Massachu- setts, No. 01-10325
20 21	02-cv-420	Rose Lynn Kobar v. Novartis Corp., et al.	Dist. of Arizona (Phoenix), No. 01- 156
22 23	02-cv-1020	Stephanie Lambert, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 02-363
24 25	02-cv-21	Ronald Lewis, et al. v. Glaxosmithkline PLC, et al.	Dist. of Connecticut (New Haven), No. 01-2093
23	<u> </u>		

26

ORDER Page - 3 -

1 2 3	03-cv-2093	Barbara Ann Lupo v. Novartis Pharm. Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Mississippi (East- ern), severed from No. 01-169
4	02-cv-918	Bernadette Massey, et al. v. Sandoz Pharm. Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Texas (Houston), No. 01-3795
6	01-cv-2167	Lurline McKinney, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-2219
7 8	03-cv-1390	Sandra Mustoe, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Northern Dist. of California, No. 01-4181
9	02-cv-278	Charles Newman, et al. v. American Home Products, et al.	Dist. of Nevada, No. 01-1345
11 12	02-cv-364	Lynne Nill, et al. v. Perrigo Sales Corp., et al.	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Cincinatti), No. 01-755
13 14	02-cv-1168	Tracy Patton v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Southern Dist. of Indiana (New Albany Div.), No. 02-47
15 16	01-cv-2164	Elvira S. Quarrels, et al. v. Bayer Corp.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Monroe), No. 01-2195
17 18	02-cv-904	Sharon Roberts-Weisner, et al. v. Whitehall-Robins Healthcare, et al.	Dist. of Colorado (Denver), No. 02-240
19 20	01-cv-2166	Perry Robinson, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-2217
21 22	01-cv-2172	Dennis Romero, et al. v. Bayer Corp.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Lafay- ette), No. 01-2196
2324	01-cv-1654	Pamela Silvey v. Smithkline Beecham Corp.	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Cincinatti), No. 01-164
25			

ORDER Page - 4 -

26

1 2	01-cv-1656	Bettye Lou Taylor, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Northern Dist. of Texas (Lubbock), No. 01-166
3	01-cv-2182	John Tutwiler, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health	Southern Dist. of Ohio (Dayton), No. 01-447
5	01-cv-2100	Nathaniel Williams v. GlaxoSmithKline, PLC et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port), No. 01-1981
7 8	01-cv-1405	Alexander P. Ziolkowski v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Dist. of Massachu- setts, No. 01-10324
9			
10 11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			

ORDER Page - 5 -